Original Article

**An investigation Into the Adoption and Use Issues of E-Health in Public Sector Hospitals of Developing Countries**

Najam Afaq Qureshi¹, Professor Ghulam Muhammad Kundi², Qamar Afaq Qureshi², Robina Akhtar³, Liaquat Hussain³

¹Dept. of Pharmacy, SARTHAD University Peshawar, Pakistan.
²Dept. of Public Administration, Gomal University DIKhan, Pakistan.
³IER, Gomal University, DIKhan, Pakistan.

**ABSTRACT**

**Background & Objectives:** The use of eHealth technologies, including mobile health, is spreading rapidly in the developing countries. According to World Health Organization (WHO), the use of mobile phones and computers is growing in these countries.

**Methods:** Majority of the programs that WHO looked at in developing countries are identified as "technology enabled," meaning they used "information and communications technology" (ICT) to improve healthcare. The leading technologies in this context are phones, computers, and texting. The later fell into third place because so many people in these countries are illiterate.

**Interpretation & Conclusion:** E-health systems are extending geographic access, data management, facilitating communications between patients and providers, and improving treatment and diagnosis. Among the leading types of tele-health in developing countries are "video chat" programs and phone "hotlines" that provide remote access to physicians. This research paper highlights the different aspects of eHealth systems with regard to adoption and use in developing countries.

**Keywords:** ICTs, Adoption, Use and Developing States.

1. Introduction

The significance of intensifying eHealth applications has also got acknowledgments by some of the international organizations for example UNDP, WHO and World Bank. These organizations are extending their full support to adopt and use IT-applications in healthcare practices especially to low income countries. The use of
IS/ICTs extend geographic access to healthcare. These IT-applications often take the form of telemedicine, which connects doctors and patients via these technologies for example, video chat, or health hotlines, which provide patients with round the clock access to qualified doctors, more improved diagnosis and treatment (Shaqrah, 2010).

Developing countries like Pakistan are seeking new solutions to improve healthcare delivery services. Digital technology can help improve the access to healthcare from the metropolitan to remote countryside, connect the people for information and analysis. These electronic devices also facilitate the people to have an access to their own health related information and allow healthcare professionals in distant and out-of-the-way areas to obtain suggestions and get the support from their coworkers who have access to information (Durrani et al., 2012). The recipients of IT-applications in healthcare organizations vary from one person and combined groups of patients to paramedical staff, physician and doctors, to national and global policymakers. It has been observed that only those designs and proposals for implementation of IT-applications in healthcare organization find the success which considers and accommodate the needs of the users of eHealth systems. Conversely, the plans which are not prepared according to the needs and demands of the users cannot find success (Kundi & Nawaz, 2006; Latifi, 2011).

2. Literature Review

This section highlight the studies conducted both in the developed as well as developing countries. Literature review was done to identify the gap between the literature and present state of eHealth systems in developing countries. This review mainly focuses on the adoption and use problems of eHealth systems.

2.1 Perspective on Health in Public Sector of Developing Countries

The advent of IT-applications has made many organizations to replace their conventional ways of doing things with the IT-based methods and procedures. Developing countries are now taking initiatives to enhance and give a proper symmetry to the existing paper-based information systems in healthcare organizations for planning and implementing an improved delivery of healthcare services. There is an ever growing belief and confidence that adoption of IT-applications in healthcare organizations can minimize the operational cost of extending different healthcare activities to the general public in developing states (Bra et al., 2004; Bra et al.2007).
ICTs/IS make the data collection and reporting flawless. The use of computers and different software make it possible to convert all paper-based routines and tasks to a mechanized nature and facilitate the data collection and report preparation in a well-organized and efficient way (Khoja et al., 2008). Furthermore, the use of technology in data collection increases the authenticity, relevance and quality of the data. Different information systems i.e. Executive Information System (EIS), Management Information System (MIS), and Transaction Processing System (TPS) can make reporting potentially much more adaptable and well-organized by allowing data to be analyzed at the different organizational levels and generate the reports of the same (Durrani et al., 2012).

2.2 Adoption and use of IT-applications in Public Sector Hospitals

a. Adoption
In comparison with the private sector health organizations, adoption and use of IT-applications in public sector organizations of healthcare is comparatively slow but is gaining momentum for all sorts of organizational processes (Chen & Perry, 2006). Due to change in the trend and effectiveness of computers, public organizations are now making efforts to adopt IT-applications because these new systems possess more positive features and potentials. Therefore, old and customary information systems are gradually being replaced with latest and mechanized information systems. Furthermore, in view of the benefits offered by IT-applications, the public sector organizations are re-assessing and re-shaping their information system requirements, patterns and structures for more productive ways of conducting business processes (Hussain et al., 2007).

b. Use
i. eHealth Improves the Routine Organizational Activities

With the arrival of new technologies, tremendous efforts are being made in developing nations in connection with restructuring their routine organizational activities by introducing ICTs/IS. These new IT-applications are also being adopted in the healthcare organizations to bring modifications in the old and unstructured paper-based information system and for more coordination and administrative efficiency regarding the delivery of healthcare services (Nhampossa, 2006). Not only the healthcare activities are carried out effectively but there is reduction in the cost of the health-related functions. The ever increasing awareness and
acceptance of eHealth systems in developing countries bring a very considerable savings in cost and extend in-time delivery of treatment and care services (Mengiste, 2010) concludes. To use the strength and capabilities of eHealth systems, various developing states including Ethiopia are going on board for IT-applications in healthcare services just to change the existing paper-based health-related data collection methods to digital data collection via health management information systems. For example, Alvarez (2004) highlighted that the steps taken by the government of Ecuador in partnership with donor agencies (such as IDA), to spread out and update the health management, in various health districts of the country just to support primary healthcare services. There are also parallel transformation and improvement proposals for decentralization of public healthcare delivery system to improve and consolidate the existing paper-based information system via IT-applications in various African countries including South Africa (Mosse, 2003), Tanzania (Kimaro, 2006), similarly, under the frame work of HISP in collaboration with other international organizations such as WHO and local and national governments are also focusing on the adoption and use ICTs in healthcare organizations (Bra et al., 2007; Lungo, 2008).

According to WHO (2006) ICTs in healthcare settings, systematize and distributes healthcare-related information to healthcare professionals and to the general public, educates the general public about the preventive measures for various diseases. Various eHealth tools and devices are used for communication and learning purposes for example, cell phones and internet can be used in promoting good public health. Cell phones are used to convey the information about the arrival of various vaccination teams in far flung areas while internet is used as a means for distant learning.

ii. Generates better Clinical Management of Patients

Several of the WHO projects concentrate on developing and implementing these technologies where they are really considered necessary. The Health Internetwork Access to Research Project for example, it gives doctors and physicians in more than 1,200 organizations of developing countries with free of charge or inexpensive online access to 2,400 of the top scientific journals in the health care subjects, thereby making health knowledge society (Dzenowagis & Kernen, 2005). A number of tele-health projects in
developing states are made feasible by the fast production of mobile phones and other wireless devices. In addition, the medical education through internet is very effective in stopping the healthcare providers to seek jobs in developed countries. The WHO has also launched a global observatory for IT-applications in healthcare organizations. Its main purpose is to chase developments in relevant fields/subjects through collection and analysis of data on digital devices and information systems being used and required by the healthcare institutions in developing countries (Raghupathi & Wu, 2011).

For more advanced plans, the European Information Society 2010 supports calls for realization of such actions as online health services, implementation of health cards, and health information networks among points of care (Tomasi et al., 2004). A EU health portal and EU-sponsored excellence criteria for health websites are visualized for the future. Chronic diseases- cancer, diabetes, heart disease, and stroke- are by far the major causes of death all over the Europe. Health promotion procedures, well-timed and appropriate diagnosis, and good control can postpone the start and alleviate the effects of these diseases, adoption and use of eHealth systems can make easy and enhance these features of healthcare (Raghupathi & Wu, 2011).

Detmer (2003) notes that ICTs helps the formation of public health information networks (PHIN), likewise, according to Scotch et al. (2008) and Loonsk et al. (2006), the aim of PHIN is to spread out the functionality of public health applications and combine them across the width of healthcare organizations in and workable needs of public health. There is also an effort to develop a national health information infrastructure. In this regard NHII provides the fundamental information planning to identify and trace global fears to public health by linking local healthcare professionals and health care executives to national data systems e.g. Centers for Disease Control and Prevention by using high-speed networks (Tang, 2002). A national health information communication network may maintain, a public health system which could possess the feature of examining, supporting, and protecting the physical condition and safety of the all the people simply by providing and sharing apparatuses and equipments in order to make possible a better clinical management of patients using vital statistics, quicker notices and warnings, and disease registries (Detmer, 2003). All these system have the capability for high-quality results on the delivery of the
healthcare services in public hospitals of the country (Raghupathi & Wu, 2011).

iii. Develops Close Watch Systems

ICTs also allow the development and use of public health close watch systems with main objective of collection, analysis and presentation of facts and figures about various diseases, their causes and preventive measures, and then present correct and complete information to decision makers (Lazarus et al., 2008). Early discovery of a biological attack with agents (anthrax, for example) may be achieved through close watch systems that distinguish infected persons in the early hours of their disease and infection.

The importance of the issue is highlighted in numerous research studies on new computer-based disease surveillance systems. The use of observation data that traces sales of over-the-counter (OTC) health care products, such as cough syrup, obtained by ill persons at the initial stage of their sickness to deal with symptoms (Chen & Perry, 2006; Bellika et al., 2007; Kundi et al., 2008). They also explained that the advent of electronic patient records and digital devices for dissemination and communication of healthcare related information among the healthcare providers increases the possibility of expanding public health reporting to determine a wide range of clinical conditions and of observing the health of the general public on a large scale (Lazarus et al. 2008; Sengupta et al., 2008).

iv. It helps in Maintaining Very Large Databases

ICTs have the potential to establish and maintain very large databases of epidemiological data, including but not restricted to life expectancy and mortality, malnutrition, immunization level, infection-rate, and sanitation level etc. Some countries have recognized ICTs-enabled surveillance systems that depend on lookout districts selected as agent of the country (Bra et al., 2004). Data collection systems for cause-specific death rates, vaccine coverage, the usefulness of vaccines, and the influence of particular health interventions can be observed and checked. Other systems identify pandemics such as the bird flu virus. These systems, when combined with suitable practices of information use, play a role considerably to increased immunization coverage and therefore to reduce infant and child mortality (Raghupathi & Wu, 2011).

v. Facilitates Distant Healthcare

Another example of the capability of ICTs in public healthcare delivery is telemedicine/telematics.
These eHealth systems facilitate a number of activities which include distant healthcare and training, particularly in countryside and far flung areas (Androuchko, 2005). As the WHO recommends, it has a most important function of facilitating initial preparation and unending learning. A study about eHealth projects in European countries, conducted by the European Health Telematics Observatory (EHTO), shows that training had a six percent contribution in adoption and use of IT-applications in healthcare organizations (MacFarlane et al., 2006; Miscione, 2007).

vi. Impact on the Deliverance of Public Health

Likewise, ICTs have an influence on the deliverance of public health through eHealth applications. The potential of eHealth to increase life expectancy, literacy, teaching and learning, and standard of living (all dimensions of human development) is noteworthy (Kwankam, 2004; Eysenbach, 2007). Over the last decade, the need to improve and manage new ways of providing effective and well organized healthcare services has matched with major developments in ICTs. As a result, there is a spectacular increase in the use of ICT applications in healthcare sector, jointly known as eHealth. Nowadays, the integration and absorption of eHealth into the daily life of healthcare workers is becoming an actuality and truth in both developed and developing states. E-health is the use, in the health sector, of digital data transmitted, stored and retrieved electronically in support of health care, both at the local site and at a distance (Kundi et al., 2008; Raghupathi & Wu, 2011).
The WHO program on eHealth for healthcare delivery (eHCD) includes IT-application in healthcare sector to provide prevention from various diseases, facilitate patients’ diagnosis, and effective management of patients’ care. These applications consist of tele-consultations, tele-referrals, forward-storage concepts (e.g., tele-radiology and tele-prescriptions) and electronic patient records (EPR) (Raghupathi & Wu, 2011). All the way through eHealth systems, more and special attention is given to basic healthcare units/centers in far flung areas to develop and enhance the worth and value of healthcare services. By attaching primary healthcare providers with primary healthcare centers and then linking these basic healthcare centers through digital devices to various sections and medical appointment centers in hospitals for the purpose of exchanging the data, a substantial improvement in accessing the data and a considerable cut-down in the cost is achieved. Therefore, primary healthcare is the main purpose of the electronic healthcare development program (Latifi, 2011).

3. Materials and Methods

Existing studies were reviewed, to comprehend the dynamics of the issues under investigation. Based on the literature review and variables below theoretical framework was developed which demonstrates the relationship between the independent variables (adoption and use of IT-application in public healthcare organizations of developing countries (IV and DV). This model is the conceptual framework of the issues addressed in the current paper.

![Figure-1: Schematic Diagram of the Conceptual Model of the Study](image-url)

As a next step, computer base software for qualitative data analysis i.e. ATLAS.ti was used...
whereas main concepts and variables were fed into software for coding, extraction of quotes and memos creation. Similarly, we examined, categorized, tabulated and recombined the data for analysis as recommended by Max (1990) ‘discourse analysis’ and Moustakas (1990) ‘heuristic analyses’ to find the fact.

4. Discussions & Analysis

Healthcare services in public sector are very much neglected field especially in developing states like Pakistan and need special consideration. The main issues are related with financial limitations and restrictions and the socio-cultural feature of the public sector hospitals (Chisolm et al., 2010). The need for government plan and concentration for the IT-applications in healthcare sector occurs due to a desperate need for improving living standards of general public by providing better healthcare services especially in developing countries (Kundi et al., 2008). In many cases, patients are ignorant of their own medical history, and if hospital records are to be destroyed after five years, there are no records of the patient’s medical history. Instead of saving space by destroying the records, healthcare organizations could get the advantages of EHR systems if government combined forces with the public health sector and supported it more (Shaqrah, 2010). EHR systems not only save money, time and space which is usually consumed while creating and preserving patients’-health record manually, but can also provide better solutions to many healthcare-related problems such as; heavy patient load, scarcity of human and ICTs resources, thick population and inadequate healthcare infrastructure. However, before the adoption and use of health information system (HIS), some challenges have to be met and offset by the hospital authorities such as; lack of motivation and support for new technologies, and resistance by the healthcare providers to adopt the eHealth systems.

Challenges and fears for which there is rational ground. Literature about USA, UK and Spain (Hier et al., 2004) explains that the obstacles in the developing and the developed nations are alike and they are facing the same disputes but the developed states have more potential to resolve these disputes because of their socio-economic factors. Shortages of computers, low speed processors, lack of computer skills, lack of proper training about EHR systems, are some of the general challenges (Fitzgerald, 2006). Yet, in majority of the developing countries secrecy, confidentiality and safety matters are the main concerns which explain that eHealth-applications are powerless to security, privacy, technological
dependence issues, and the technology ultimately has problems too and it will almost certainly remain to be so (Kundi et al., 2008; Soar et al., 2012). Thus, some care is required while executing EHR systems. Complete switching over to a computerized system and having no manual record at all in the start might be a problem, this is why the change process could be slow and steady initially (Eric et al., 2006). However, the general aim is to save lives and reduce pain. If ICTs, and therefore EHR systems, can be utilized to contribute to that, it is important to think about adoption and use of IT-applications in healthcare organizations. In addition, economical and organizational barriers have been recognized in United Kingdom and Spain. This explains that implementation of EHR systems is a continuing process which does not end with just introducing the system in healthcare institutions (Shaqrah, 2010). Therefore, according to Kundi (2010) and Kundi et al. (2012) it is imperative to continuously keep on up-dating the systems due to rapid environmental changes both in technology and organizational and management practices.

5. Conclusion & Recommendations

ICT is being deployed around the world in many areas including the health. Prospective beneficiaries of IS/ICTs consist of different stakeholders in important healthcare organization both public and private as a whole in the low income states. It is clear from the analysis of the existing sources of research that all the people directly or indirectly involved and associated with hospitals must be given importance and recognition. It is important to ensure and verify all the persons and factions within the healthcare organizations that may be the prospected users of eHealth systems, along with taking into account their capabilities and requirements also; besides these beneficiaries could also be analyzed on the basis of their locations and accessibility.

A recommended device for decision-makers in scheduling and preparation for intended beneficiaries in broad-spectrum, and beneficiaries within important healthcare organizations in specifically, is to collect as much details regarding the needs of target people as possible. These details may be about the duties and responsibilities of each and every healthcare provider at all the different levels of healthcare organizations, details about the needs and requirements of all healthcare providers in concordance with their capabilities required for using a variety of IT-applications. This study also concludes and
recommends that the authorities must go for short, medium, and long-term farsightedness and planning for maintainability of the eHealth systems within a healthcare setup. As eHealth continues to evolve, many of the current challenges faced by health systems in developing countries, such as the shortage of health workers in rural areas, the variable quality of care, lack of patient compliance, and fraud, will potentially be mitigated through the wide deployment of ICT. It will be crucial to continue to track which of these purposes are being successfully fulfilled by technology and what devices and use cases are most effective in attaining them. This will require more systematic evaluations and better codification of lessons learnt from existing programs, which in turn will allow programs that are currently struggling to employ technology to make educated decisions about when and how to implement ICT.

References


